



1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38

**SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
 RATE FAIRNESS BOARD
 CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**Minutes of Special Meeting
 Tuesday, April 11, 2023, 10:00 AM – 12:00 PM
 (Approved April 28, 2023)**

Members of the Rate Fairness Board will attend this meeting in-person. Members of the public are invited to observe the meeting in-person or remotely online as described below. Members of the public attending the meeting in person or remotely online will have an opportunity to provide public comment on every item. It is possible that not every person in the queue will have an opportunity to provide remote public comment.

In-person Meeting: San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC), 525 Golden Gate Avenue, 3rd Floor, Tuolumne Conference Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

Virtually Via Zoom:

1. Modern Browser (WebRTC) [Best]

Please join with a modern browser such as Google Chrome or Microsoft Edge (no additional installation required)

2. Mobile Apple iOS or Android devices: Mobile users can also join with Zoom Cloud Meetings App on [Apple App Store](#) iOS or [Google Play Store](#) Android

3. Meeting [Link](#)

Meeting ID: 898 4902 4866

Passcode: 340499

4. Join by Telephone [Audio only]: US: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 213 338 8477 or +1 669 219 2599 or +1 646 518 9805

Meeting ID: 898 4902 4866

Passcode: 340499

Meeting will be recorded for minutes only and will not be published. By joining this meeting, you agree to be recorded during the duration of this meeting.

London N. Breed
Mayor

Newsha K. Ajami
President

Sophie Maxwell
Vice President

Tim Paulson
Commissioner

Anthony Rivera
Commissioner

Kate H. Stacy
Commissioner

Dennis J. Herrera
General Manager



39 **MEETING AGENDA**

40

41 *Materials Distributed: Special Meeting Agenda for April 11, 2023; Draft Special*
42 *Meeting Minutes of March 17, 2023; Copy of public comment received by*
43 *email on March 28, 2023; Responses to Requests from Board Members on*
44 *2023 Water and Sewer Rates Study presentation; Fiscal Year 2023-2024*
45 *CleanPowerSF Rates presentation; Rate Fairness Board Recommendations to*
46 *San Francisco Public Utilities Commission on 2023 Water and Sewer Rates*
47 *Study draft presentation; Draft SFPUC Rate Fairness Board Bylaws*

48

49 **1. Call to Order**

50

51 *The special meeting of the SFPUC Rate Fairness Board (RFB) was called*
52 *to order at 10:04 AM in-person and via teleconference.*

53

54 **2. Roll Call**

Member Name/Title	Appointed By
Howard Ash, Chair, Residential City Retail Customer	Board of Supervisors
Trisha McMahon, Budget and Planning Manager	City Administrator
Ken Hinton, Budget and Revenue Analyst	Controller's Office
Vishal Trivedi, Financial Analyst of Office of Public Finance	Controller's Office
<i>Vacant</i> , City Retail Small Business Customer	Board of Supervisors
<i>Vacant</i> , City Retail Large Business Customer	Mayor's Office
<i>Vacant</i> , Residential City Retail Customer	Mayor's Office

55

56 *Roll Call:*

- 57 • *Present: Chair Ash, Member Hinton, Member McMahon, Member*
- 58 *Trivedi*

59

60 **3. General Public Comment**

61 Members of the public may address the Rate Fairness Board (RFB) on
62 matters that are within the Board's jurisdiction but not on today's agenda.

63

64 *Public Comment: The RFB Secretary read a public comment from Mr. Don*
65 *Levison that was received by email on March 28, 2023.*

66

67 **4. Approval of the Special Meeting Minutes of March 17, 2023**

68 (Discussion and Action)

69

70 *Chair Ash asked Board for comments, questions, or concerns. There were*
71 *no comments from the Board.*

72

73 *Public Comment: Mr. David Pilpel had one suggested edit to the March 17,*
74 *2023 meeting minutes.*

75

76 *The minutes of the special meeting of March 17, 2023, were adopted, as*
77 *amended, unanimously upon a motion by Member Trivedi and seconded by*
78 *Member McMahon.*

79

80 *Roll Call Vote:*

- 81 • *Ayes: Chair Ash, Member Hinton, Member McMahon, Member Trivedi*

82

83 **5. Report of the Chair**

84

85 **a. Responses to Requests from Board Members on 2023 Water** 86 **and Sewer Rates Study**

87 (Presentation and Discussion)

88 Matthew Freiberg, SFPUC Principal Revenue/Rates Analyst

89

90 *Matthew Freiberg presented the Fiscal Year 2023-2024*
91 *CleanPowerSF Rates Setting. Presentation included the following*
92 *topics: water/sewer customer bill impacts, rate structure impact on*
93 *single-family residential bills, and annual general fund water and*
94 *sewer bill. Discussion transpired throughout presentation. Member*
95 *Hinton noted that City departments are facing simultaneous*
96 *pressures on gas and steam costs alongside SFPUC rate*
97 *increases.*

98

99 *Public Comment: Mr. David Pilpel wanted to know the bill impacts*
100 *on Non-General Fund Departments. He also wanted to know the*
101 *total revenue shift for water and wastewater.*

102

103 *Public Comment: Ms. Amy Nagengast wanted to better understand*
104 *how the increased rates would impact the San Francisco Airport.*

105

106 **b. Fiscal Year 2023-2024 CleanPowerSF Rates**

107 (Presentation and Discussion)

108 Yee Nwe (Ma Yee) Yap, SFPUC Principal Revenue/Rates Analyst

109

110 *Yee Nwe (Ma Yee) Yap presented on the Fiscal Year 2023-2024*
111 *CleanPowerSF Rates. Presentation included the following topics:*
112 *rates setting, revenue requirement, cost of service rates, rate*
113 *design, proposed CleanPowerSF generation rates, bill impact,*
114 *delegated authority, and upcoming milestones. Discussion*
115 *transpired throughout presentation.*

116

117 *Member McMahon asked how many customers switched from*
118 *PG&E residential E-ELEC rates to CleanPowerSF residential E-*
119 *ELEC rates. Ma Yee Yap expressed that PG&E will respond to*
120 *SFPUC with the results.*

121

122 *Public Comment: Mr. David Pilpel had various questions and*
123 *comments on the Fiscal Year 2023-2024 CleanPowerSF rates and*
124 *implementation.*

125

126 **6. Items Initiated by Board Members**

127 **a. Rate Fairness Board Recommendations to San Francisco**
128 **Public Utilities Commission on 2023 Water and Sewer Rates**
129 **Study**

130 (Discussion and Possible Action)

131

132 *Chair Ash went through the draft Rate Fairness Board presentation*
133 *on the SFPUC staff proposed power rates and water/wastewater*
134 *rates. The Board Members would like to see the consultant's water*
135 *and sewer rates study report before making more comments/edits*
136 *on the Rate Fairness Board recommendation to the San Francisco*
137 *Public Utilities Commission. Discussion transpired throughout.*

138

139 *Public Comment: Mr. David Pilpel had comments on the refuse*
140 *rates setting process and the system reliability.*

141

142 **b. Rate Fairness Board Bylaws**

143 (Discussion and Action)

144

145 *Chair Ash went through the changes on specific sections in the*
146 *bylaws. The Board Members suggested some edits to the bylaws.*
147 *Discussion transpired throughout.*

148

149 *Public Comment: Mr. David Pilpel had some suggestions and*
150 *comments to the edits in the bylaws.*

151

152 *The Rate Fairness Board Bylaws or Rules of Order, were adopted,*
153 *as amended, unanimously upon a motion by Member Trivedi and*
154 *seconded by Member McMahon.*

155

156 *Roll Call Vote:*

- 157
 - *Ayes: Chair Ash, Member Hinton, Member McMahon, Member*
- 158 *Trivedi*

159

160 **Announcements and Requests for Future Agenda Items**

161 (Discussion)

162

163 *Chair Ash asked when the next meeting will be scheduled. The next*
164 *meeting is tentatively scheduled for the week of April 24th.*

165

166 *Chair Ash expressed that he intends to present at the May 9th Commission*
167 *meeting on the Fiscal Year 2023-2024 CleanPowerSF rates, as well as the*

168 *May 23rd Commission meeting on the proposed water and wastewater*
169 *rates.*

170

171 *Public Comment: Mr. David Pilpel thanked the Board Members and SFPUC*
172 *staff.*

173

174 **7. Adjournment**

175

176 *Meeting adjourned at 12:15 PM.*

177

178 **Accessible Meeting Policy:** To obtain meeting materials in alternative format, please
179 contact the Rate Fairness Board Secretary at 415-554-3477 or via email at
180 RateFairnessBoard@sfwater.org. Providing at least 72 hours notice will help to
181 ensure availability. Written reports or background materials for calendar items are
182 available on-line at [https://sfpuc.org/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-](https://sfpuc.org/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-board)
183 [fairness-board](https://sfpuc.org/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-board).

184
185 **Meeting Procedures:** Public Comment will be taken before or during the
186 Board’s consideration of each agenda item. Speakers may address the Board
187 for up to three minutes on that item. During General Public Comment,
188 members of the public may address the Board on matters that are within the
189 Board’s jurisdiction and are not on the agenda. Procedures do not permit: 1)
190 persons in the audience to vocally express support or opposition to statements
191 by Board Member, by other persons testifying; 2) ringing and use of cell
192 phones, pagers, and similar sound-producing electronic devices; 3) bringing in
193 or displaying signs in the meeting room; and 4) standing in the meeting room.
194 The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing
195 electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the
196 Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s)
197 responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-
198 producing electronic devices.

199 **Know your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance:** Government’s duty is to
200 serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions,
201 boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct
202 the people’s business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted
203 before the people and that City operations are open to the people’s review. For
204 information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the
205 San Francisco Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the ordinance,
206 contact by mail Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett
207 Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102; phone at (415) 554-7724; fax at
208 (415) 554-7854; or by e-mail at soff@sfgov.org.

209 Citizens may obtain a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance by printing Chapter
210 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at
211 <http://www.sfbos.org/sunshine>.

212 **311 Free Language Assistance:** 免費語言協助/ Ayuda gratuita con el idioma
213 / Бесплатная помощь переводчиков / Trợ giúp Thông dịch Miễn phí /
214 Assistance linguistique gratuite / 無料の言語支援/ 무료 언어 / 지원 / คว“มชจ
215 ยเหลือี ทังภ“ษ“โดยไมคํ ส่วยคหจจ าย / Libreng tulong para sa wikang Tagalog ยเหลือี

216 **Lobbyist Registration and Reporting Requirements:** Individuals and entities
217 that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action
218 may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [SF Campaign &
219 Governmental Conduct Code Sec. 2.100] to register and report lobbying
220 activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the
221 San Francisco Ethics Commission at 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, San

222 Francisco, CA 94102; telephone (415) 252-3100; fax (415) 252-3112; web site
223 at www.sfgov.org/ethics.

224 **Explanatory documents** that have been provided to the Board in connection
225 with this agenda are available for public inspection online at
226 [https://sfpuc.org/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-](https://sfpuc.org/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-board)
227 [board](https://sfpuc.org/about-us/boards-commissions-committees/rate-fairness-board).