



**SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION**  
City and County of San Francisco

**London N. Breed**  
Mayor

**REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**  
**Tuesday, April 23, 2024**  
**1:30 PM**  
**(Approved May 14, 2024)**

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
City Hall, Room 400

**Commissioners**

Tim Paulson, President  
Anthony Rivera, Vice President  
Sophie Maxwell  
Newsha Ajami  
Kate H. Stacy

Dennis J. Herrera  
General Manager

Donna Hood  
Commission Secretary

1. Call to Order

*President Paulson called the meeting to order at 1:30 pm.*

2. Roll Call

*Present: Paulson, Rivera, Maxwell, Ajami, and Stacy*

*At the request of Vice President Rivera, a moment of silence was observed for active-duty firefighter Lt. Stephen Silvestrich, who passed recently.*

3. Approval of the Minutes of April 9, 2024

*No public comment.*

*On motion to approve the Minutes of April 9, 2024.*

*Ayes: Paulson, Rivera, Maxwell, Ajami, and Stacy.*

4. General Public Comment

- *Peter Drekmeier, Tuolumne River Trust, gave thanks and appreciation for Commissioner Sophie Maxwell and Commission Secretary Donna Hood.*
- *John Rosapepe commented on the low levels of salmon in the Tuolumne River and requested the SFPUC not to appeal the results of the lawsuit. He also gave thanks to Commissioner Maxwell.*
- *Dave Warner gave thanks to Commission Secretary Hood and Commissioner Maxwell. He also issued a statement on the future of the Water & Wastewater Enterprises.*
- *Bill Martin, Sierra Club of California, thanked Commissioner Maxwell and Commission Secretary Hood for their years of service. In addition, he spoke about the Bay Delta Water Quality Plan Update and how recent findings point to our rivers needing more water / higher water levels.*
- *Francis Mendoza, Save California Salmon, thanked Commissioner Maxwell and Commission Secretary Hood for their service. He also commented on how salmon fishing has been shut down and how the mismanagement of water is endangering the salmon ecosystem.*
- *Denise Louie, Center for Biological Diversity, thanked Commissioner Maxwell and Commission Secretary Hood for their service and requested the SFPUC not to appeal the lawsuit and revisit the 10-Year Capital Plan.*
- *Scott Artis, Golden State Salmon Association, commented on the low river flows in Tuolumne River and how they contribute to the loss of salmon. He also read a letter from a colleague.*
- *Nancy Arbuckle, Tuolumne River Trust, commented on the high water rates and lawsuits.*
- *Zarene commented on the possible extinction of salmon by 2055. She also stated there is a future where the opportunity to restore a healthy watershed ecosystem by 2055 is possible.*
- *Unidentified speaker commented on the preservation of salmon and restoring water and river flows.*
- *Michael Frost, Restore the Delta, commented on the water supply and extinction levels of fish.*
- *Daphne Frost quickly stated that water is life and commented on the importance of freshwater flows.*
- *Charlene Woodcock, Tuolumne River Trust and Restore the Delta, requested revisions of*

water policies in effect.

- *Jakob Evans, Sierra Club of California, commented about the recent lawsuit, managing a drought in accordance with the Bay Delta Plan and protecting SFPUC ratepayers.*
- *Mary Butterwick requested a revision to the designed drought in order to sustain healthy river flows for salmon.*
- *Scott Webb, Resource Renewal Institute, showed his support for his colleagues, urged the SFPUC to prioritize healthy rivers and stated he looks forward to working with the Commission.*
- *Cindy Charles, Tuolumne River Trust and California Sport Fishing Protection Alliance, shared photos of her family members partaking in salmon fishing, which was a family pastime that is no longer possible due to the SFPUC's actions. She also thanked Commission Maxwell & Commission Secretary Hood for their service.*
- *Patti Regehr asked the Commission to make appropriate choices to ensure a prosperous legacy and future.*
- *Glenn Rogers, CSFN, commented about the health of Mill Valley Park, its thriving salmon levels and how the designed drought is not working.*
- *Cintia Cortez, Restore the Delta, spoke about native tribe displacement, water quality issues becoming air quality issues and invited the Commission to tour the delta.*
- *Unidentified speaker commented on working with the San Francisco Conservation Corp to receive grants but has issues with affluents that are damaging the Bay. Working with youth and the SFPUC seems contradictory.*
- *Jennifer Vataru, Remote Caller, provided comments regarding the Pierce Street outfall and her submission in [writing](#).*

## 5. Report of the General Manager

### a) Water and Wastewater Customer Assistance Program Update

*Diedre Andrus, Customer Service Bureau (CSB) Director provided a timeline as to the background of the Customer Assistance Program (CAP), which began in July 2004 and has had multiple amendments since, with the latest in July 2023 with the program expanded for more eligible customers. Director Andrus then introduced the CAP staff.*

*Director Andrus discussed pandemic-related challenges and opportunities including (1) State Arrearage Relief (delayed resumption of collections; and planned post-enrollment income verification); (2) Non-Rate Funding Sources; and (3) Operational Challenges (program stability, governance and transparency; and on-line application and access while protecting customer personally identifiable information).*

*Director Andrus indicated there have been 1,004 CAP applications received, with 276 (27%) approved and 728 (73%) denied due to account having an active discount (24%), account not eligible (15%), address does not match account address (1%), applicant has multiple accounts (1%), income exceeds program limits (39%), or no or incomplete responses (21%). Director Andrus noted that CSB staff are responsive to customer appeals and work directly with customers to review appeals, indicating 63% were approved and 37% were denied.*

*Director Andrus stated the CAP is monitored quarterly by management to review performance and to ensure funding remains available. Total program funding as of December 2023 was \$2,013,039. Participants by Zip Code and Tier 1 and Tier 2 total*

discount amounts: 94112: 1,166 total participants for a total discount amount of \$80,484.20; 94134: 1,128 participants for a total discount amount of \$52,308.93; 94116: 778 participants for a total discount amount of \$34,005.41; 94122: 758 participants for a total discount amount of \$32,561.70; and 94124: 742 participants for a total discount amount of \$38,454.46.

Director Andrus discussed 2023 communications and outreach efforts that include CAP webpages, FAQ's, applications and community flyers in eight languages; Outreach to Chinese, Filipino, and Spanish speaking communities, including Filipino and Cantonese language radio and television commercials, advertisements in Sing Tao newspaper, geotargeted Spanish language E-blasts in partnership with Univision, and digital streaming and social media ads in Filipino, Chinese, and Spanish languages; Outreach to Southeast Communities, including radio and digital ads on KBLX, newspaper ads in the Sun Reporter, and custom banners, posters and newsletter articles for the Southeast Community Center; Geotargeted social media and Google ads; multilingual flyers included with 120,000 SFPUC bills and e-blasts to all residential customers with emails on file; 1,000 MUNI bus ads in four languages; Communications kits shared with the Board of Supervisors and community-based organizations, in eight languages; and tabling at key community events with custom posters and handouts in relevant languages.

Director Andrus reviewed the Shut-Off Policy, noting exceptions for extenuating circumstances. There have been no shutoffs since March of 2020, with resumptions planned in July 2024 on accounts over \$50.

President Paulson thanked Director Andrus for the presentation and information provided.

Commissioner Ajami questioned the number of participants who live in rental units. Director Andrus stated she could obtain the requested information.

Commissioner Stacy thanked Director Andrus for the presented information and questioned the number of denials and appeals. Director Andrus stated the CAP program tries everything it can to approve participants.

Commissioner Maxwell commented on the denial letters not being in the same language and thanked Director Andrus for the tremendous amount of work the CAP team does. She questioned when shutoffs would occur and how we obtain the funds that would allow these procedures. Nancy Hom, Chief Financial Officer, stated individuals who are truly eligible should file for appeals and have every intent of continuing outreach. Commissioner Maxwell stated the main issue is centered around documentation being provided in the same language. Dennis Herrera, General Manager, summarized Director Andrus and CFO Hom's comments, providing a clearer explanation. Commissioner Maxwell reiterated her appreciation of the program and the service it provides and stated she was in agreement with CFO Hom.

Commissioner Ajami requested clarification on the number of denials and echoed Commissioner Maxwell's comments. Commissioner Ajami also questioned the amount of outreach to these specific customers; Director Andrus stated the program team is constantly reviewing this data and no shutoffs have occurred within the last two years.

*Commissioner Rivera thanked Director Andrus for her report and questioned if there are any accommodations for (disabled) veterans. Director Andrus stated it is something that could be reviewed in the future.*

*No public comment.*

b) San Francisco Public Utilities Commission Retirement Recognition

*GM Herrera introduced retirement recognitions for both Commissioner Maxwell and Commission Secretary Donna Hood. All Commissioners made parting comments for both Commissioner Maxwell and Commission Secretary Hood.*

Public Comment

- *Carla Vaughn thanked Commissioner Maxwell for being the outstanding individual she is and Commission Secretary Hood for all the assistance over the years.*
- *Nicole Sandkulla thanked both Commissioner Maxwell and Commission Secretary Hood for their combined service as faithful public servants.*
- *Ed Harrington commented on his time with the SFPUC and working directly with both Commissioner Maxwell and Commission Secretary Hood.*

c) Report on Recent San Francisco Public Utilities Commission Activities, Events and Announcements

*None.*

6. Bay Area Water Supply and Conservation Agency Update

*Nicole Sandkulla, CEO, Bay Area Water Supply and Conservation Agency (BAWSCA) discussed their Annual Survey, which has been conducted since 1996 and includes a collection of key service area information by individual agency and for region. The 2022-23 Annual Survey can be found on the BAWSCA website. She indicated the FY2022-23 water use data reflects drought conditions.*

*CEO Sandkulla indicated (1) FY 2022-23, 32% less water was used in the BAWSCA region compared to FY 1986-87, despite a 34% population increase; (2) Water use efficiency investments resulted in a 52% decrease in residential per capita use in the BAWSCA region since 1975-76; (3) Average resident in BAWSCA region used 55 gallons per day in 2022-23; (4) Comparison of two years shows the impact of local action on average residential water use; (5) BAWSCA agencies rely on the Regional Water System for two-thirds of their total water supply; and (6) BAWSCA agencies project more investment in conservation and other supplies, plus the Regional Water Supply purchases to meet future customer needs.*

*CEO Sandkulla stated that BAWSCA is working for a reliable water supply for its member agencies and their water customers.*

*Commissioner Ajami commented on how the demand for water has remained the same, even with the massive population growth.*

*No public comment.*

7. CONSENT CALENDAR

- a) Approve Modification No. 1 to Job Order Contract No. JOC-95, General Engineering (A License) Construction (Marine Emphasis), San Francisco, San Mateo, Santa Clara, and Alameda Counties with Power Engineering Construction Co. to increase the contract duration by three years for a total contract duration of five years and to increase the contract amount by \$2,500,000 for a revised not-to-exceed contract amount of \$7,500,000, for additional time and capacity for facility and asset improvements. ([Resolution 24-0099](#))
- b) Approve the novation of Contract No. PUC-0002.F, Master As-Needed Security System Maintenance and Integration Services from Universal Protection Security Systems, Limited Partnership DBA Allied Universal Technology Services, to Securadyne Systems Intermediate, LLC DBA Allied Universal Technology Services. ([Resolution 24-0100](#))

Public Comment

- *No public comment.*

*On motion to approve the Consent Calendar:*

*Ayes: Paulson, Rivera, Maxwell, Ajami, and Stacy*

8. Approve and adopt the CleanPowerSF Load Management Standards Plan to meet the requirements of the California Energy Commission’s Load Management Standards regulations regarding the development of electricity rates that vary hourly or sub-hourly and/or qualifying demand flexibility programs that use time-varying price signals based on the cost to produce electricity. The Plan does not propose to develop or adopt hourly or sub-hourly electricity rates nor qualifying demand flexibility programs at this time. ([Resolution 24-0101](#))

*Mike Hyams, Assistant Deputy General Manager (DGM), Power Enterprise began with a review of the Load Management Standards (LMS) background, noting the California Energy Commission’s updated LMS took effect on April 1, 2023, with new requirements for large community choice aggregators, and reviewed LMS goals and requirements.*

*DGM Hyams discussed CleanPowerSF’s existing time of use rates, which encourage the use of electrical energy at off-peak hours, encourage daily and seasonal usage to improve reliability, lessen or delay the need for new electric capacity, and reduce fossil fuel consumption and greenhouse gas emissions. Real-time price residential rates examples were provided.*

*President Paulson asked for clarification on what exactly is being asked of the Commission; DGM Hyams provided an explanation of the proposed recommendation.*

*Commissioner Ajami requested clarification on the pricing of rates and how this plan would apply only to individuals who have smart home appliances.*

*Commissioner Stacy requested clarification on demand and affordability and an improvement on the real-time pricing rates.*

*Commissioner Maxwell requested an explanation on “lessen or delay the need for new electrical capacity”; DGM Hyams provided an explanation. Commissioner Maxwell asked if there could*

*be a program for low-income families to have access to these smart home appliances and represent a different category of family and/or customer type.*

*Commissioner Ajami echoed Commissioner Maxwell's statements and requested more pilot programs stemming from this plan to see how it would possibly impact the bills of ratepayers.*

*No public comment.*

*On motion to approve item 8:*

*Ayes: Paulson, Rivera, Maxwell, Ajami, and Stacy*

9. Public Hearing to consider and approve the Power Miscellaneous Fee schedule, which includes the revision of existing fees and the elimination of certain fees for account and billing services related to the SFPUC's provision of electric service. If approved, the proposed fees will become effective July 1, 2024, and will remain effective until revised. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the Project for the purposes of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code section 31.04(h). The Planning Department has determined that the Project is exempt from the CEQA. The Commission will rely on that determination to make its decision on this action. ([Resolution 24-0102](#))

*Kristin Avenis, Rates Analyst provided an overview of miscellaneous fees, indicating charges are for individual customers for optional services or as penalties and deposits. Revenues received reduce the need to increase retail rates, enhancing equity for rate payers.*

*Analyst Avenis discussed the miscellaneous fee study schedule which began in 2023 and will conclude on July 1, 2024, with the adoption of the proposed miscellaneous fees, unless otherwise stated in the adopted schedule of fees. She discussed the miscellaneous fee methodology which consists of (1) Cost of providing service (labor, overhead, and materials and equipment); (2) Policy screening (affordability considerations and penalties to incentivize compliance); and (3) Staff review (coordination with department managers, and executive review). She discussed the detailed costs of providing this service.*

*Rates Analyst Avenis stated the Power Fees evaluated (1) Fees with no proposed changes (late payment penalty, lie fee, return check charge, document reproduction charge, lost, stolen or damaged equipment charge, and CleanPowerSF's termination fee); (2) Fees escalated using CPI (security deposit); (3) Proposals to eliminate Fees: (pending shutoff notice fee, field action charge, pole or underground disconnections, and field visits); and (4) Fees updated with new cost data: (temporary service installation and removal fee).*

*Rates Analyst Avenis discussed the temporary service installation and removal fee, indicating it is a flat fee charged to customers requesting temporary electric service during construction or development projects. The current fee is \$376 with a proposed fee off \$1,036 with the large increase due to updated labor costs and time spent to perform the service. A survey of fees assessed by peer utilities found that California power suppliers charge anywhere from \$200 to \$5,000 for similar services.*

*No public comment.*

*On motion to approve item 9:*

*Ayes: Paulson, Rivera, Maxwell, Ajami, and Stacy*

10. Communications

- a) Advance Calendar
- b) Annual Electric Reliability Compliance Program Report
- c) Annual Power Risk Management Plan
- d) Contract Advertisement Report
- e) Correspondence Log
- f) Green Infrastructure Grant Program Update
- g) Power Quarterly Report on Delegated Authority Contracts Pursuant to Administrative Code Section 21.43
- h) Quarterly Report on Contracts Awarded by the General Manager Pursuant to Delegated Authority
- i) Water Supply Conditions Update

11. Items initiated by Commissioners

*Commissioner Ajami recognized Monday was Earth Day and acknowledged the importance of maintaining our viable water sources and the upkeep of our ecosystem.*

12. Adjournment

*President Paulson adjourned the meeting at 4:49 pm.*