



**San Francisco Public Utilities Commission
 Citizens' Advisory Committee**

MEETING MINUTES

**Tuesday, March 15, 2022
 5:30 p.m. – 7:00 p.m.**

PARTICIPATE VIA ZOOM VIRTUAL CONFERENCE SOFTWARE

Meeting URL

<https://sfwater.zoom.us/j/89413461192?pwd=TmpHQ0czSGN6cFAySy9tRHU5RHZ0QT09>

Phone Dial-in

669.219.2599

Find your local number: <https://sfwater.zoom.us/j/89413461192?pwd=TmpHQ0czSGN6cFAySy9tRHU5RHZ0QT09>

Meeting ID/Passcode

894 1346 1192 / 247105

This meeting is being held by Teleconference Pursuant to the Governor's Executive Order N-29-20 and the Sixteenth Supplement to Mayoral Proclamation Declaring the Existence of a Local Emergency Dated February 25,2020

During the Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) emergency, the San Francisco Public Utilities Citizens Advisory Committee's (SFPUC CAC) regular meeting room, 525 Golden Gate Ave., 3rd Floor Tuolumne Conference Room, is closed. CAC Members and SFPUC staff will convene CAC meetings remotely by teleconference. Members of the public are encouraged to submit their public comment on agenda items in advance of the teleconference meeting by emailing comments to cac@sfwater.org. Comments submitted no later than 12 PM Tuesday the day of the meeting will be read into the record by SFPUC CAC Staffing Team members during the teleconference meeting and will be treated as a substitute to providing public comment during the meeting. Persons who submit written public comment in advance on an agenda item or items will not be permitted to also provide public comment on the same agenda item(s) during the meeting.

Mission: The purpose of the SFPUC CAC is to provide recommendations to the SFPUC General Manager, the SFPUC Commission, and the Board of Supervisors regarding the agency's long-term strategic, financial, and capital improvement plans ([Admin. Code Article XV, Sections 5.140 - 5.142](#))

Members:

Moisés García, Chair (D9)

- Marría Evbuoma (D1)
- Suki Kott (D2)
- Steven Kight (D3)
- Douglas Jacuzzi (D4)
- Emily Algire (D5)
- Barklee Sanders (D6)
- Joshua Ochoa (D7)
- Amy Nagengast (D8)

VACANT (D10)

- Jennifer Clary (D11)
- Maika Pinkston (M-Environmental Org.)
- Nicole Sandkulla (M-Regional Water Customers)
- Marisa Williams (M-Engineering/Financial)
- Eliahu Perszyk (M-Large Water User)
- VACANT (B-Small Business)
- Michelle Pierce (B-Environ. Justice)

London N. Breed
 Mayor

Anson Moran
 President

Newsha Ajami
 Vice President

Sophie Maxwell
 Commissioner

Tim Paulson
 Commissioner

Dennis J. Herrera
 General Manager

OUR MISSION: To provide our customers with high-quality, efficient and reliable water, power and sewer services in a manner that values environmental and community interests and sustains the resources entrusted to our care.



D = District Supervisor appointed, M = Mayor appointed, B = Board President appointed

Staff Liaisons: Mayara Ruski Augusto Sa and Jobanjot Aulakh
Staff Email for Public Comment: cac@sfwater.org

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to order and roll call at 5:30 pm

Members present at roll call: (10) García, Kott, Kight, Jacuzzi, Algire, Sanders, Ochoa, Clary, Williams, and Perszyk

Members Absent: (5) Evbuoma, Nagengast, Pinkston, Sandkulla, and Pierce

Staff presenters: John Scarpulla

Members of the Public: Peter Drekmeier

*Member Pinkston joined at 5:40 pm and left at 6:36 pm. Quorum maintained.

2. Approve [February 15, 2022](#) Minutes

Motion was made (Clary) and seconded (Kott) to approve the February 15, 2022 Minutes.

AYES: (10) García, Kott, Kight, Jacuzzi, Algire, Sanders, Ochoa, Clary, Williams, and Perszyk

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: (5) Evbuoma, Nagengast, Pinkston, Sandkulla, and Pierce

Public Comment: None

3. Report from the Chair

- Welcome members, staff, and the public
- Ohlone Tribal Land Acknowledgement - [SF Public Library Acknowledgment](#)
- Chair García reached out to the MOHCD (Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development) to see if there is any funding set aside in the upcoming budget cycle for the American Indian Cultural District to help the CAC craft their own land acknowledgement
- Appreciation for District 1 representative Marria Evbuoma

Public Comment: None

4. Public Comment: Members of the public may address the Committee on matters that are within the Committee's jurisdiction and are not on today's agenda

Peter Drekmeier introduced himself as the Policy Director for the Tuolumne River Trust. They were pleased with the workshops held by the SFPUC focused on the science behind the Bay Delta Water Quality Control Plan, the Tuolumne River Voluntary Agreement, demand projections, demand management, alternative water supplies, and climate change. Once the information was available and they had a chance to present at all the workshops that staff and other experts attended, the Commission would then have enough information to make some big decisions, which the Tuolumne River Trust feels are long and coming on the length of the design drought and on demand projections. The final workshop was focused on the Long-Term Vulnerability Assessment, which was a great study of climate change and other issues but did not directly answer questions that the Commission needs answered to make a big decision. They followed up with recommendations and information requests and were met with silence. Eventually, they deduced what they could from the report. Drekmeier sent a letter to the SFPUC on February 4th from a coalition of NGOs (Non-Governmental Organization) that simply asked that staff address their questions. If there are disagreements, they can discuss them and confirm or deny certain things that were concluded. Drekmeier asked for the CAC's help the Tuolumne River Trust get SFPUC staff to respond to reasonable information requests and recommendations.

5. **Discussion and Possible Action:** [Resolution Making Findings to Allow Teleconferenced Meetings Under California Government Code Section 54953\(e\)](#)

Motion was made (Clary) and seconded (Perszyk) to adopt the resolution.

The motion PASSED with the following votes:

AYES: (11) García, Kott, Kight, Jacuzzi, Algire, Sanders, Ochoa, Clary, Pinkston, Williams, and Perszyk

NOES: (0)

ABSENT: (4) Evbuoma, Nagengast, Sandkulla, and Pierce

Public Comment: None

6. **Presentation and Discussion:** [Emergency Firefighting Water System 2050 Planning Study](#), John Scarpulla, Director of Strategic Initiatives, External Affairs

Introduction:

Member Clary commented that San Francisco has a firefighting high pressure water system that was created after the 1906 earthquake, which runs mostly in the downtown area. Two or three bond measures were voted about this. In developing that bond measure, the Supervisors wanted some basic public feedback in the process because there is a great deal of discussion on how that system will equally protect all parts of the City. The Supervisors asked that the SFPUC regularly brief the CAC on the progress of the program and the planning for expansion in the system.

Presentation

- Emergency Firefighting Water System (EFWS) 2050 Planning Study

- Study Objectives
- Existing System, 2050 Demands, Improved System
- Potential Future System Improvements
- Potential System Improvements (Map)
- Conventional EFWS Pipeline Improvements
- Potable EFWS (PEFWS) Pipelines
- PEFWS Pipeline Improvements
- Water Supply Sources
- Other EFWS Improvements
- Results: System Performance
- Performance of Proposed System
- Westside Seawater Supply Option
- Program Cost Estimate
- Conclusions for Recommended Option
- Questions?

Discussion

- **Member Sanders** asked that the maps in presentation slides include Treasure Island.

Staff Scarpulla responded that the map does not include firefighting pipelines that development projects are required to install. If someone is building a single building, they will be required to install an emergency firefighting water system pipeline. If someone is building a large development project, such as Lake Merced, Treasure Island, or Pier 70, the fire department of the SFPUC will work with the developer to ensure that they install emergency firefighting water system pipelines. Those are not represented in the slides that were just presented. On Treasure Island, specifically, the developer is installing a dedicated fire pipeline like the emergency firefighting water system that will be connected to a fire pump station. There will be a fire pump station out there that is dedicated just to pump up the pressure for high pressure firefighting. It will use sea water and manifolds that are installed throughout Treasure Island. San Francisco has manifolds too, but they are along the coast of Treasure Island and the Bay. Fire boats can pull up to them and push water through them to fight fires. They were used in San Francisco to fight the fire close to Ghirardelli Square three or four years ago. Fire boats came up and used the manifolds to fight the fire, and that is similar to what will be installed on Treasure Island.

- **Member Clary** commented that slide five shows that District 11 will be the last one to be retrofitted. Clary also commented that slide 11 shows water sources and District 11 does not have a water source listed there. Visitacion Valley and Crocker Amazon are not protected.

Staff Scarpulla responded that slide five does not state that District 11 will be the last one.

Member Clary responded that all information in green is marked as “potential” and “future”.

Staff Scarpulla responded that it is potential and future, but only red is funded. There is no order for the remaining items, which are unfunded.

Member Clary commented that if someone says phase one, phase two, and future, that seems like the order in which funding will be requested.

Staff Scarpulla responded that the SFPUC is not requesting funding. It will be up to the Board of Supervisors whether they want to put out bonds.

- **Member Clary** asked if the SFPUC has considered any interim protection measures that can be taken in the neighborhoods that are going to be approved last.

Staff Scarpulla responded affirmatively. Hose tenders are high tech fire trucks that provide significantly greater capacities. Based on the study that the SFPUC has put together, the fire department has requested 20 hose tenders as part of their budget. They have received four to date. They are under construction now and cost \$1 million each. Hose tenders have about 5,000 feet of pipe, can run about a mile, and can bring water at high pressures from the high-pressure system to all these areas. The plan from the fire department is to place them strategically in areas that do not have as much access to the existing pipelines and to work with the SFPUC to make sure there is water flow through these hose tenders to ensure that there is high pressure and high volume in these areas. This is the interim measure.

- **Member Clary** responded that slide 11 lists the water sources and there are no potential sources listed in District 11.

Staff Scarpulla responded that there are no reservoirs in District 11.

Member Clary commented that District 11 has the McLaren Tank.

Staff Scarpulla responded that University Mound is close to McLaren. Although many areas throughout San Francisco do not have a water supply within their district, it does not mean the water supply is not going there. University Mound, College Hill, Stanford, and Lake Merced, and the seawater supply that they wanted to put on the east side are all going to feed into the pipelines that are serving Districts 9, 10 and 11. Basically, not having a reservoir in a particular area does not mean that water is not going to be available there.

- **Member Jacuzzi** commented that there are several members of the community in District 4 that are concerned about the engineering regarding the water pressure from Lake Merced to the Richmond District and the Inner Richmond. The community is also concerned that using the Lake Merced water and the Inner Sunset Reservoir water could lead to potential mixing in terms of back flow and contamination of domestic water after firefighting and reducing the amount of actual domestic water that they might need after an earthquake. Member Jacuzzi has sat in on meetings in District 4 and it seems like there is information that is not making it through between the SFPUC and the community. It is either misinformation or a misunderstanding. It would be good to connect the community members and SFPUC.

Staff Scarpulla offered to attend community meetings. It is a complicated system that is not easy to understand. The SFPUC uses hydraulic modeling instead of guessing the pressure available. They use the geography including elevations, pipe diameters, pipe materials, size of the pumps, and the number of turns. They use all of this to determine whether they have the high pressure required by the firefighter. The calculations were performed by world renowned, independent experts and not just SFPUC staff. Regarding the Richmond District, it was a deliberate move by the fire department, the SFPUC, Supervisor Fewer and now Supervisor Connie Chan to make sure that the pipeline that goes through the Inner Richmond goes all the way up to Veterans Hospital and that it has high pressure firefighting water. The SFPUC wants to ensure that the firefighters have the pressure and volume needed. The fire department is required to approve all the improvements that the SFPUC does. The Fire Department only approves plans once the SFPUC guarantees the pressure and volumes. Two Fire Department Chiefs have now signed off on this plan based on the calculations.

Member Jacuzzi responded that he expected it would have been thoroughly calculated. Member Jacuzzi then asked Staff Scarpulla to speak on the potential contamination.

- **Staff Scarpulla** commented that California has strict cross contamination controls. The SFPUC's Water Quality Division, the State and City Departments of Public Health, and State regulators are required to sign off on the SFPUC's cross connection and contamination control. If the magnitude of a fire requires it, they would fill the potable EFWS (Emergency Firefighting Water System) with Lake Merced water. If there are future sea water connections, it would be the same issue. After firefighting is complete, established protocols require the SFPUC to flush and disinfect the lines and do a host of water quality testing to ensure that the water going through the system after the firefighting is ready for drinking. It has been a long time since San Francisco has had an earthquake. Staff Scarpulla would like to remind folks and have them remind their friends that everyone should have 72 hours' worth of drinking water at their house. This is because it could take 72 hours to put out the fires, decontaminate lines, and get water supplies to two areas. It could be that they are not going directly to everyone's house due to multiple breaks, which is why it is critical to have at least 72 hours' worth of supplies before more emergency water supplies can come regardless of this plan.
- **Member Sanders** asked why Treasure Island cannot be included in the maps for the presentations. If the information exists and staff can provide it, Treasure Island should be included in the maps.

Staff Scarpulla responded that they should have infrastructure for the development areas marked on the map, such as Treasure Island, Merced, and Pier 70. Staff Scarpulla thinks this is a great point and they should have a fifth color of pipelines, which would consist of development firefighting pipelines being installed that meet the Fire Department and SFPUC's standards for high pressure.

- **Chair García** asked if the Emergency Firefighting Water System was funded by revenue bond or general obligation bond.

Staff Scarpulla responded that it was a general obligation bond and not a SFPUC revenue bond. Firefighting water systems cannot be funded with Prop 218 money. The Board of Supervisors, Mayor's office and the Capital Planning Committee determine when general obligation bonds are issued. The Civil Grand Jury Report of 2019 recommended that the Board of Supervisors should analyze a standalone Emergency Firefighting Water System bond to fund its upgrades and improvements.

Chair García asked if that would be a bond that is issued over time over the next 20 or so years.

Staff Scarpulla commented that this is a decision for the Board of Supervisors.

- **Chair García** commented that the presentation mentioned that pumping requires a significant amount of energy. Chair asked what the source of energy after an earthquake would be.

Staff Scarpulla responded that the systems have back-up generators as the SFPUC cannot rely on the grid to provide energy if there is a 7.9 earthquake. During a large fire that is non-seismic related, they will use the Emergency Firefighting Water System. Most fires need just the low-pressure system provided by hydrants. The large fires require the Emergency Firefighting Water System, which are powered through Hetch Hetchy Power and back-up generators if needed. In an earthquake situation, the SFPUC is assuming the power is off and that generators will be used.

Public Comment: None

7. **Presentation and Discussion: Subcommittee Preferences and Reassignment**, Moisés García, Full CAC Chair

Introduction

- **Chair García** remarked that the Wastewater subcommittee is down to three members as two members have recently left or will be leaving the CAC. The Power and Water Subcommittees currently have six members each. Chair García invited members to consider switching or being on two subcommittees at once.

Discussion

- **Staff Sa** commented that there are a wide range of topics that are presented to the Wastewater Subcommittee such as sewer overflow measures, the Ocean Beach Climate Adaptation Plan, wastewater quality and several other topics.
- **Member Clary** asked when the Wastewater Subcommittee meets.

Member Perszyk responded the second Tuesday of the month.

Member Jacuzzi stated that he would think about this.

Chair García added that the Wastewater Subcommittee typically meets every other odd month, and the next meeting is scheduled for May.

- **Chair García** asked that interested CAC members email him or Staff Sa.

Public Comment: None

8. Staff Report

- CAC meetings will be held virtually until further notice. The Mayor's office will reassess the situation at the end of March and Staff Sa hopes to have an update for the CAC in early April.

Public Comment: None

9. Future Agenda Items and Resolutions

- Environmental Justice Team Portfolio – *tentatively* April
- Education Efforts Update – *tentatively* April
- Corruption and Accountability Measures – *tentatively* May
- Affordability and Assistance Programs – *tentatively* June
- Water Equity and Water Access for Homeless – *tentatively* June
- Succession Planning – HR Practices
- Lake Merced
- Treasure Island Power and Outages
- Racial Equity – Composition of the Management Team
- Power Rate Increases
- Commissioners Visit
- Drought and Bay Delta Discussion
- CleanPowerSF and Hetch Hetchy Power Study Rates
- Agency-wide Planning & Policy on Climate Change & Adaptation
- Interagency Working Group on Sea Level Rise
- Contracting Process
- Education Resolution
- PUC Properties and City Department Partnerships
- Workforce Programs
- Water Rights and Raker Act
- Water Use and Parks
- Flooding Protection
- Water Quality Report
- Green New Deal
- Micro Hydroelectric Power
- Prop A Bond Funding
- SECFC/CAC Joint Meeting

Adopted Resolutions for Follow Up

- Resolution for Continued Support and Budget for SFPUC Racial Equity Plan and Community Benefits [adopted on September 21, 2021](#)
- Resolution in Support of a Resilient Water Supply [adopted August 17, 2021](#)
- Resolution in Support of SB 612 Electrical Corporations and other Load-Serving Entities [adopted on July 20, 2021](#)

- Resolution in Supporting of the Transition of CleanPowerSF Residential Customers to Time-of-Use Rates [adopted on July 20, 2021](#)
- Resolution in Support of the Southern Skyline Boulevard Ridge Trail Extension project [adopted April 20, 2021](#)
- Resolution in Support of Interim Emergency Rate Assistance Program and Revised Community Assistance Program [adopted on July 21, 2020](#)
- Resolution in Support of a Skilled and Diverse Utility Workforce [adopted February 19, 2019](#)
- Resolution Honoring the Life, Activism, and Contributions of Dr. Espanola Jackson to the Local Community [adopted on April 19, 2016](#)
- Resolution on Balboa Reservoir [adopted March 15, 2016](#)

10. **Announcements/Comments** Please visit www.sfpuc.org/cac for confirmation of the next scheduled meeting, agenda and materials.

- **Member Clary** commented that she is working on SB 222. This bill would establish a statewide low-income rate assistance program for water, which is a program similar to the one that power has had for the last 30 years. The San Francisco Democratic Party will be considering a Resolution to support it at their next meeting, which will take place on March 23, 2022.
- **Chair García** asked all members to let him know of any issues that they or their community cares about that the Democratic Party could support. Chair García offered to speak to the Chair about issues that the Party could support. Chair García also provided the link for the meeting of the San Francisco Democratic Party: <https://www.sfdemocrats.org/meetings/2022/3/13/agenda>.
- Per request of **Member Jacuzzi**, all CAC members did a brief introduction of themselves.

Public Comment: None

11. Adjournment

Motion was made (García) and seconded (Clary) to adjourn the meeting.

Meeting was adjourned at 6:40 pm.